

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**BEFORE THE ETHICS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

In the Matter of
Alpha J. Buie, treasurer of the African
American Democratic Club,

Respondent.

SFEC NO. 13-131112

Decision and Order

This decision and order are issued in support of the Ethics Commission's previously announced decision in the matter of Ethics Complaint number 13-131112 at its regularly held meeting of January 23, 2017. On January 23, the Ethics Commission conducted a hearing on the merits of this matter. Milad Dalju, Esq. appeared on behalf of the Executive Director and Ethics Commission Staff. Respondent appeared pro se. At the hearing, all five members of the Ethics Commission accepted into evidence Staff's Hearing Brief and associated Exhibits, heard testimony from Respondent, considered the factual record and legal arguments presented by Staff, and took public comment. Having considered the pertinent law and facts, the Ethics Commission unanimously makes the following findings and order:

FINDINGS OF FACT

On October 19, 2011, Respondent Alpha J. Buie formed a general-purpose committee for "African American political education and voter registration." See Declaration of Shaista Shaikh (Shaikh Dec.), Exhibit 1, p. 2, Respondent's Form 410 Statement of Organization. Respondent Buie identified herself as the Treasurer for the Committee and Charles Spencer as the Principal Officer. *Id.* On October 27, 2011, the Committee filed its first Recipient Committee Campaign Statement Form 460 (Form 460), which covered the period of January 1 to October 22, 2011. See Shaista Dec., Exhibit 2. On that Form 460, Respondent reported receiving \$1,000 in contributions. *Id.*

1 On July 19, 2012, during the time-period when the Committee was still actively filing campaign
2 statements, Respondent Buie spoke with Ethics Commission Fines Collection Officer Ernestine Braxton
3 about late fines the Committee had accrued. See Declaration of Ernestine Braxton, ¶ 4. Respondent Buie
4 requested a waiver of \$2,720.00 in late fees because she was new to the duties of treasurer and was
5 handling a family emergency involving her mother during the 2012 election period. *Id.*, Exhibit 4.
6 Respondent Buie produced newspaper articles and travel receipts accounting for time she spent
7 removing her mother from an elder care center where her mother had suffered physical abuse and
8 neglect. *Id.* Executive Director John St. Croix granted Respondent Buie's waiver request for good cause
9 on September 7, 2012. *Id.* ¶ 5, Exhibit 5.

10
11 On October 25, 2012, Respondents filed their last Form 460 statement covering the reporting
12 period from October 1 to October 20, 2012. See Shaista Dec., Exhibit 3. On that Form 460, Respondent
13 Buie was still identified as the Treasurer for the Committee. *Id.* at p. 1. Respondent reported receiving
14 \$9,570.00 in contributions year to date and making \$13,503.76 in expenditures year to date. *Id.* at
15 Exhibit 3, p. 3. Respondent also reported an ending cash balance of \$5,216.51. *Id.* Respondent gave no
16 indication that she was terminating the Committee. To date, Respondent has not terminated the
17 Committee by filing a Terminating Statement Form 410 or filed any other reports indicating whether
18 fundraising or expenditure activity has occurred over the last four years. See Shaista Dec. ¶¶ 6-7.

19
20 Prior to the hearing on the merits, Respondent last communicated with Staff in October 2014.
21 At the time, Respondent Buie represented to Staff that she had verbally resigned as the Committee's
22 treasurer in November 2012. Staff advised Respondent Buie that she could not formally resign until she
23 filed a statement of resignation with the Committee. Respondents worked with Staff to obtain records
24 documenting how the Committee wound down its ending cash balance. At some point, Respondent Buie
25 even participated in a conference call with former Ethics Commission Executive Director John St. Croix
26

1 and a Wells Fargo bank representative because the Wells Fargo bank held the Committee's checking
2 accounts. According to Respondent, the bank representative told Respondent and Mr. St. Croix that the
3 accounts Ms. Buie had managed on behalf of the Committee in 2012 no longer existed. At the
4 conclusion of the hearing on the merits, the Commission accepted Respondent's representation that the
5 accounts affiliated with the Committee are closed. Nobody can confirm that the Committee has ceased
6 all political activity, but during public comment, former Committee President Charles Spencer promised
7 to make sure the Committee formally terminated its status as a general purpose committee as soon as
8 possible after the hearing on the merits.

9 **Conclusions of Law**

10
11 The San Francisco Charter, Appendix C3.699-13(c) authorizes the Commission to hold a public
12 hearing to assess penalties and order remedial relief if, based on substantial evidence, the Commission
13 determines that Respondents have violated the law. The Commission's Enforcement Regulations at
14 Section XII.A.2 further elaborates on the Commission's authority, providing that "a respondent has
15 committed a violation of law only if a person of ordinary caution and prudence would conclude, based
16 on a preponderance of the evidence, that the respondent has committed the violation." Any person
17 who "intentionally or negligently violates any of the provisions of this Chapter shall be liable in an
18 administrative proceeding before the Ethics Commission held pursuant to the Charter for any penalties
19 authorized therein." CFRO § 1.170(c). The Political Reform Act makes treasurers—such as Respondent
20 Buie—personally responsible for complying with campaign finance laws: "It shall be the duty of each . . .
21 treasurer . . . to maintain detailed accounts, records, bills, and receipts necessary to prepare campaign
22 statements, to establish that campaign statements were properly filed, and to otherwise comply with
23 the provisions of this chapter." Cal. Govt. Code § 84104. For the following reasons, the Commission finds
24 that Respondent committed 3 violations of CFRO based on a preponderance of the evidence.
25
26

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

3
4
5
6
7
8
9

- 10
-
- 11
-
- 12
-
- 13
-
- 14
-
- 15
-
- 16
-
- 17

18
10

20
21
22
23
24
24

1 whether Respondents legally wound down her campaign, accepted unlawful contributions, continued to
2 fundraise, expended money inappropriately, etc. Three reporting periods passed prior to the Commission's
3 determination of probable cause in this matter.

4 The Commission finds that Respondent committed three separate violations of CFRO § 1.106 as follows:

5 **Count 1.** By failing to file the required semi-annual Form 460 covering the reporting period of
6 October 21 through December 31, 2012, by January 31, 2013, Respondents committed one
7 violation of CFRO § 1.106.¹

8 **Count 2.** By failing to file the required semi-annual Form 460 covering the reporting period of
9 January 1 through June 30, 2013, by July 31, 2013, Respondents committed one violation of
10 CFRO § 1.106.

11 **Count 3.** By failing to file the required semi-annual Form 460 covering the reporting period of
12 July 1 through December 31, 2013, by January 31, 2014, Respondents committed one violation of
13 CFRO § 1.106.

14 **FINAL ORDERS**

15 **THEREFORE, the Commission makes the following ORDERS:**

16 1. **Liability:** Respondent Alpha Buie, as the treasurer for the African American
17 Democratic Club, committed three violations of the Campaign Finance Reform Ordinance as presented.

18 2. **Injunctive Relief:** The San Francisco Charter, at Appendix § C3.699-13(C),
19 authorizes the Commission to require Respondent to file any reports, statements, or other documents
20 or information required by law. Respondent Alpha Buie is hereby ordered to file a Form 410
21 termination statement and any missing Form 460 campaign statements with the Ethics Commission on
22 or before February 15, 2017. Failure to file missing statements will result in further enforcement action.

23 If Respondent Buie is unable to account for money listed as cash on hand on the Committee's last-filed
24

25
26 ¹ CFRO § 1.106 incorporates by reference the PRA, Cal. Govt. Code § 84200(a).

1 campaign statement, Respondent Buie is ordered to write a letter to the Commission explaining the
2 reason(s).

3 3. **Administrative Penalty:** Because Respondent presented evidence that she
4 attempted to comply with the Campaign Finance Reform Ordinance in good faith and because
5 substantial penalties would not further the purposes of CFRO, the Commission assesses an
6 administrative penalty against Respondent Buie of \$1.00 per violation for a total of \$3.00. Pursuant to
7 Enforcement Regulations, section XII.C.3, Respondent shall remit payment within 90 days of the
8 Commission's decision by delivering a check or money order to the Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness
9 Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, California, 94102.

10 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

11
12
13
14 Dated: Jan 24, 2017



Paul A. Renne
Chairperson, San Francisco Ethics Commission